

THE NATURAL RESOURCE DAMAGE ASSESSMENT DESKBOOK

A Legal and Technical Analysis

2nd Edition

Valerie Ann Lee

P.J. Bridgen

Environment International Ltd.

&

Acadia Law PLLC

ENVIRONMENTAL LAW INSTITUTE

Washington, D.C.

Copyright © 2002, 2014
Environmental Law Institute
2000 L Street NW, Washington, DC 20036

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and recording, or by any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the copyright holder.

Published 2002. Second edition published March 2014.

ISBN 978-1-58576-168-5

About the Authors

Valerie Ann Lee is the president of Environment International Limited, an environmental consulting firm, and the principal of the law firm Acadia Law PLLC; both are headquartered in Seattle, Washington. For over 25 years, she has assisted state, federal, tribal, and private clients in natural resource claims and damage assessments and has achieved positive results cost-effectively. She has assisted clients in conducting streamlined natural resource damage assessments (NRDAs) and helped them grapple with coordination of response actions and NRDAs under the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act (CERCLA). In both her consulting and legal practices, Ms. Lee has provided assistance to clients in environmental matters including those involving compliance with natural resource, environmental, and land-use planning laws, brownfields redevelopment, and litigation of natural resource damage claims. Ms. Lee formerly was a trial attorney for the U.S. Department of Justice's Environment Enforcement Section, where she filed and litigated some of the first natural resource damage cases and achieved success in reaching settlements that led to innovative and successful restoration projects. While at the Department of Justice, Ms. Lee also litigated enforcement cases for federal agencies under federal statutes, including those discussed in this deskbook. Recognized for her expertise, she has testified before the U.S. Congress, state governors, and tribal councils. She has published articles on climate change, brownfields redevelopment, the Endangered Species Act, and alternative dispute resolution. Ms. Lee received a J.D. from the Yale Law School, an M.S. in civil engineering from the Massachusetts Institute of Technology, and a B.S., *magna cum laude*, in biology from Bates College. She can be reached via e-mail at valerie.lee@eilttd.net and valerie.lee@acadiaw.com.

P.J. Bridgen is an officer of Environment International Limited and an expert in risk assessment, risk communication, environmental management, natural resource damage assessments (NRDAs), cost allocations under the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act, and environmental management systems (EMS). Dr. Bridgen has provided advice to private parties and governments, including tribal governments, in connection with NRDAs across the United States, participating in both litigation and successful, cost-effective collaborative assessments. Dr. Bridgen is certified as a lead auditor for International Organization for Standardization 14001 EMS and was one of the first experts in the United States to be so designated. Dr. Bridgen's expertise in environmental matters has been recognized nationally. Appointed by the Administrator of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Dr. Bridgen served on the Technology and Innovation Committee, a part of the National Advisory Council on Environmental Policy and Technology, and, by Cabinet-level appointment, served on the National Biotechnology Policy Board that advises the president and the U.S. Congress. Dr. Bridgen has testified before Congress and served as a liaison to the White House on environmental issues as an executive director of a trade organization. Dr. Bridgen received a Ph.D. in biochemistry from Leicester in England, was a postdoctoral fellow and research associate at the National Institutes of Health and at Cambridge University, and received an M.B.A. with distinction from the Wharton School and a B.Sc. with honors in biochemistry from Leeds in England. Bridgen has contributed to the literature on brownfields redevelopment and EMS.

Environment International Ltd. is a consulting firm with headquarters in Seattle, Washington. EI is an interdisciplinary team of experienced environmental managers, lawyers, engineers, scientists, and policy analysts who specialize in natural resource damage assessments, risk assessment, site investigation, sustainable development, and alternative dispute resolution of environmental matters. EI's clients include private parties and governments. The firm's website can be found at www.eilttd.net.

Acadia Law PLLC, is a Seattle-based law firm focusing on environmental law, litigation, and dispute resolution services. Acadia Law attorneys provide representation in natural resource damage assessment matters and have a depth of experience providing advice under the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act. Acadia Law also provides dispute resolution services in connection with environmental and commercial disputes. Visit the firm's website at www.acadiaw.com.

Acknowledgments

The authors would like to acknowledge the staff of Environment International Ltd. (EI), who provided assistance in the preparation of this deskbook. In particular, Hana Rubin contributed to the restoration chapter and provided research support. Rubin also was EI's outstanding patient in-house editor for the entire deskbook. Aron Borok provided support for the analysis of economic tools in natural resource damage assessment (NRDA) and graphic support to help explain concepts in injury determination and damage valuation. Stephani Ayers assisted in the legal analysis of the Marine Protection, Research, and Sanctuaries Act (MPRSA) and the National Park System Resources Protection Act (NPSRPA). EI's resident historian and congressional watchdog, Dan O'Brien, provided valuable information that contributed to an understanding of the precipitating events that motivated Congress to enact the statutes discussed.

For this second edition, we wish to thank Marcus Lee for his contribution and his assistance in updating case law, regulations, and policy. Jesse Sayles provided specific content on ecological and human-environment sciences and practices. The assistance of these staff members contributed greatly to the development of this updated edition.

We caution the reader, however, that the authors take full responsibility for the content and tenor of the deskbook. Any omission or lack of insight is ours alone and notwithstanding the thoughtful comments of all those who provided review and assistance. We hope that the reader finds this deskbook useful.

Dedication

To my mother, who knee-deep in tide pools taught me at an early age love of the environment and all things scientific.

To my father, who told me that science is interesting but showed me that law and politics often drive decisions.

To Gary, Harry, and Steve, scientists with a vision, who made good science part and parcel of environmental litigation. To Mike and Jen, who implemented their vision and made it all worth the while.

~ *VAL*

To Dorothy and Arthur Beresford, my parents, who helped me become who I am today.

~ *PJB*

Table of Contents

Introduction	xvii
Chapter 1 — Natural Resource Damage Assessment Concepts and Players.....	1
1.1 <i>Introduction.....</i>	1
1.2 <i>An Overview of Natural Resource Damage Assessment Concepts.....</i>	1
1.2.1 Injury and Damage.....	1
1.2.2 Compensatory Focus Through Restoration.....	1
1.2.3 Natural Resource Damage Assessment Elements.....	2
1.2.4 Assessment Costs.....	3
1.3 <i>Trustees and Their Role in Damage Assessments.....</i>	3
1.3.1 Federal Trustees.....	4
1.3.2 State Trustees	4
1.3.3 Tribal Trustees.....	4
1.3.4 Foreign Natural Resource Trustees	5
1.4 <i>Cooperative Assessments.....</i>	5
Chapter 2 — Historical Context for Natural Resource Damage Assessment	7
2.1 <i>Introduction.....</i>	7
2.2 <i>Statutory Evolution</i>	8
2.2.1 The Trans-Alaska Pipeline Authorization Act	8
2.2.2 The Deepwater Port Act of 1974.....	9
2.2.3 1977 Amendments to the Clean Water Act—Inclusion of State Trustees as in the Natural Resource Damage Enforcement Model.....	10
2.2.4 1980 & 1986—The Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act and the Superfund Amendments and Reauthorization Act of 1986.....	10
2.2.5 1988 Amendments, the Marine Protection, Research, and Sanctuaries Act.....	11
2.2.6 The National Park System Resource Protection Act	11
2.2.7 Coming Full Circle, the Oil Pollution Act of 1990	11
2.3 <i>The Common Body of Natural Resource Damage Law and Science.....</i>	12
Chapter 3 — Character of the Event and Coverage of Federal Authorities	13
3.1 <i>Agent Causing Injury</i>	13
3.2 <i>Location of the Event or Incident</i>	14
3.3 <i>Resources Potentially Affected and Trustees</i>	15
3.4 <i>Natural Resource Damage Assessment Trustees</i>	16
3.5 <i>Time Frame of the Event or Injury.....</i>	18

Chapter 4 — The Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act	19
4.1 Introduction.....	19
4.2 Overview of Statutory Framework.....	20
4.2.1 The Superfund.....	21
4.2.2 The National Priorities List	21
4.2.3 Response Actions	23
4.2.4 Natural Resource Damages.....	26
4.3 Liability Framework.....	30
4.3.1 Summary.....	30
4.3.2 Standard of Liability	31
4.3.3 Type and Character of Event Triggering Liability.....	34
4.3.4 Natural Resource Injuries “Resulting From” Releases	37
4.3.5 Presumptions in Litigation.....	40
4.3.6 Responsible Parties.....	41
4.3.7 Those That Just Look Like Responsible Parties.....	44
4.3.8 Defenses.....	44
4.3.9 Exceptions and Limitations to Liability	45
4.4 Considerations in Natural Resource Damage Litigation	49
4.4.1 Statute of Limitations	49
4.4.2 Right to Jury Trial and Record Review	50
4.4.3 Preemption of State Law.....	50
4.4.4 Claims Brought by Tribes on Behalf of Tribal Members: Public Versus Private Losses in Indian Country.....	52
4.4.5 Indispensable Parties	52
4.5 Amendments of 2002 Applying to Response Cost Liability	53
4.5.1 De Micromis Exemption.....	53
4.5.2 Municipal Solid Waste Exemption	54
4.6 Natural Resource Damages for Climate Change?.....	55
Chapter 5 — The Oil Pollution Act	57
5.1 Introduction.....	57
5.2 Statutory Framework and Liability	57
5.2.1 Type and Location of Discharge Triggering OPA Liability.....	58
5.2.2 Standard of Liability and Responsible Parties.....	62
5.2.3 Defenses and Limitations to Liability	63
5.3 Recoverable Costs and Damages.....	65
5.3.1 Removal Costs	66

5.3.2	Compensatory Damages	66
5.3.3	Natural Resource Damages.....	67
5.4	<i>Considerations in Claims</i>	69
5.4.1	Notice and Election of Remedies	69
5.4.2	Jurisdiction	70
5.4.3	Statute of Limitations	71
5.4.4	Presumptions in Litigation.....	71
5.4.5	Right to Jury Trial	71
5.4.6	Settlements.....	72
5.4.7	Preemption of State Law.....	72
5.5	<i>Claims Against the Fund</i>	73
5.5.1	The Fund.....	73
5.5.2	Claimants.....	73
5.5.3	Categories of Compensable Costs and Damages.....	73
5.5.4	Procedures for Making Claims Against the Fund	74
Chapter 6 — The Clean Water Act		77
6.1	<i>Introduction</i>	77
6.2	<i>Statutory Framework for Natural Resource Damages</i>	78
6.2.1	Summary.....	78
6.2.2	Type and Location of Action Triggering CWA Liability.....	78
6.2.3	Standard of Liability and Responsible Parties.....	80
6.2.4	Defenses, Exclusions, and Limitations to Liability	81
6.3	<i>Recoverable Costs and Damages</i>	83
6.3.1	Removal Costs	83
6.3.2	Natural Resource Damages.....	84
6.3.3	Gulf Coast Restoration Fund	84
6.4	<i>Considerations in Claims</i>	85
6.4.1	Jurisdiction	85
6.4.2	Statute of Limitations	85
6.4.3	Ripeness.....	85
6.4.4	Presumptions in Litigation.....	86
Chapter 7 — The Marine Protection, Research, and Sanctuaries Act		87
7.1	<i>Introduction</i>	87
7.2	<i>Overview of Areas Under the Protection of MPRSA</i>	87
7.3	<i>Statutory Framework</i>	90
7.4	<i>Natural Resource Damage Liability</i>	91

7.4.1	Type of Action and Location Triggering MPRSA Liability	92
7.4.2	Standard of Liability	92
7.4.3	Sanctuary Resources	93
7.4.4	Liable Parties and Things.....	94
7.4.5	Recoverable Costs and Damages.....	94
7.5	<i>Defenses</i>	95
Chapter 8	— The National Park System Resource Protection Act	97
8.1	<i>Introduction</i>	97
8.2	<i>Liability</i>	98
8.2.1	Type and Location of Action Triggering §19jj Liability	98
8.2.2	Standard of Liability and Responsible Parties.....	98
8.2.3	NPSRPA Case Management.....	99
8.2.4	Defenses and Limitations to Liability	101
8.3	<i>Recoverable Costs and Damages</i>	101
Chapter 9	— Federal Trustees	103
9.1	<i>Introduction</i>	103
9.2	<i>U.S. Department of Commerce</i>	104
9.3	<i>U.S. Department of the Interior</i>	105
9.4	<i>U.S. Department of Agriculture</i>	108
9.5	<i>U.S. Department of Energy</i>	108
9.6	<i>U.S. Department of Defense</i>	109
Chapter 10	— Natural Resource Damage Assessment Elements and Regulations	111
10.1	<i>Introduction</i>	111
10.2	<i>Overview of Elements in a Natural Resource Damage Assessment</i>	112
10.3	<i>The CERCLA Regulations</i>	112
10.3.1	Pre-Assessment	113
10.3.2	Assessment Planning	115
10.3.3	Type B Assessment.....	116
10.3.4	Type A Assessment.....	122
10.4	<i>The OPA Regulations</i>	124
10.4.1	Pre-Assessment	125
10.4.2	Restoration Planning.....	126
10.4.3	Restoration Implementation	130
10.5	<i>Development and Interpretation of Damage Assessment Regulations</i>	131
10.6	<i>Development of the CERCLA Regulations</i>	131
10.6.1	<i>Ohio v. Dep't of Interior</i>	132

10.6.2	<i>Kennecott v. U.S. Department of the Interior</i>	134
10.6.3	2008 Regulation Updates to Comply With <i>Ohio</i> and <i>Kennecott</i>	136
10.7	<i>Development of OPA Regulations</i>	137
10.7.1	Monitoring Costs and Attorneys Fees	137
10.7.2	Residual Removal Authority.....	138
10.7.3	Contingent Valuation.....	138
10.7.4	Other Substantive Provisions Upheld	138
10.7.5	2002 Regulatory Updates to Comply With <i>General Electric</i>	139
Chapter 11 — Techniques in Injury Assessment		141
11.1	<i>Introduction</i>	141
11.2	<i>Definition of Injury</i>	142
11.2.1	Physical Injuries.....	142
11.2.2	Injury as Measured Through Services.....	143
11.3	<i>Injury Assessment Framework</i>	143
11.3.1	Develop a Management Plan	144
11.3.2	Designate an Appropriate Damage Assessment Team.....	144
11.3.3	Review Readily Available Information	145
11.3.4	Focus the Assessment: Identify Possible Injuries and Pathways and Consider Probable Area of Effect.....	146
11.3.5	Select Assessment Methods, Develop Work Plans, Begin to Identify Restoration Options.....	149
11.4	<i>Injury Assessment Methods and Considerations</i>	150
11.4.1	Methods to Determine Injury.....	151
11.4.2	Methods for Determining Baseline.....	152
11.4.3	Considerations in Study Design and Quality Assurance.....	153
11.5	<i>Summarizing the Results of the Injury Assessment and Connection With Damage Assessment</i>	155
11.6	<i>Conclusion</i>	156
Chapter 12 — Coordination of CERCLA Remedial Actions and Natural Resource Injury Determinations		157
12.1	<i>Introduction</i>	157
12.2	<i>Why Coordination Is Important</i>	157
12.3	<i>Remedial Action Process</i>	157
12.3.1	Site Identification	157
12.3.2	Preliminary Assessment and Site Inspection	159
12.3.3	NPL Listing Decision	159
12.3.4	Remedial Investigation and Feasibility Study.....	160

12.3.5	Record of Decision	160
12.3.6	Implementation of Cleanup—Remedial Design and Remedial Action ...	161
12.4	<i>Human Health and Ecological Risk Assessment</i>	161
12.4.1	Components of Risk Expression.....	162
12.4.2	Human Health Risk Assessment.....	162
12.4.3	Ecological Risk Assessment	165
12.4.4	Current Status of Risk Assessment	167
12.5	<i>Opportunities for Coordination of Remedial Investigations and NRDA</i>	168
12.5.1	EPA Notice to and Involvement of Trustees in Remedial Action Activities	168
12.5.2	Remedial Investigation Characterization of the Nature and Extent of Contamination.....	168
12.5.3	Risk Assessments and NRDA: Differences and Opportunities.....	169
12.5.4	Quality of the Remedial Action	171
12.6	<i>Coordination Examples</i>	171
12.7	<i>Challenges to Coordination</i>	171
12.8	<i>Promising Next Steps for Coordination of ERAs and NRDA</i>	172
Chapter 13	— Tools and Techniques in Assigning Damage	173
13.1	<i>Introduction</i>	173
13.2	<i>Important Concepts in Damage Determination</i>	173
13.2.1	Elements of Natural Resource Damage	174
13.2.2	The Evolution of Approaches to Damage Assessment	174
13.2.3	Scaling.....	177
13.2.4	Baseline and Challenges Presented in a Changing Environment.....	178
13.3	<i>Restoration, Replacement, or Acquisition Cost and Primary Restoration</i>	180
13.3.1	Alternative Selection.....	180
13.3.2	Cost Estimation	181
13.4	<i>Interim Losses</i>	182
13.4.1	Interim Losses Through Resource-to-Resource or Service-to-Service Approach	183
13.4.2	Interim Losses Through Economic Valuation Techniques.....	188
13.5	<i>Assessment Costs</i>	197
13.5.1	Assessment Costs Under the CERCLA Regulations.....	198
13.5.2	Assessment Costs Under the OPA Regulations.....	198
Chapter 14	— Restoration Planning and Implementation	199
14.1	<i>Introduction</i>	199

14.2	<i>Restoration Objectives and Players</i>	200
14.2.1	Objectives	200
14.2.2	Restoration Concepts and Approaches.....	201
14.2.3	Players—Trustees, Potentially Responsible Parties, and the Public.....	203
14.3	<i>Restoration Plan Development and Selection: Steps in the Process</i>	206
14.3.1	Form a Restoration Planning Team	207
14.3.2	Develop a Range of Restoration Alternatives.....	208
14.3.3	Apply Screening Criteria and Focus Planning Activities	210
14.3.4	Develop Better Information on Alternatives Passing the Screen	210
14.3.5	Scale the Alternatives	211
14.3.6	Apply Criteria and Identify a Preferred Restoration Alternative	213
14.3.7	Prepare a Draft Plan, Receive Comment, and Prepare a Final Plan	213
14.4	<i>Resolution of Liability and Restoration Implementation</i>	215
14.4.1	Implementation—The Choice for PRPs	215
14.5	<i>Illustrative Examples of Restoration Actions</i>	216
14.5.1	Habitats	217
14.5.2	Resources	223
14.5.3	Restoration of Lost Services for Humans	229
14.6	<i>Legal Considerations in Planning and Selection of a Restoration Plan</i>	232
14.6.1	National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA).....	232
14.6.2	Oil Pollution Act Requirements and Integration With the National Environmental Policy Act.....	234
14.6.3	Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act; Marine Protection, Research, and Sanctuaries Act; Clean Water Act; and National Park System Resources Protection Act.....	236
14.7	<i>Legal Considerations in Restoration Implementation</i>	236
14.7.1	Potentially Relevant Federal Laws	237
14.7.2	State, Local, and Tribal Requirements	239
Chapter 15	— Cooperative Assessments	241
15.1	<i>Introduction</i>	241
15.2	<i>The Cooperative Assessment Approach</i>	242
15.2.1	The Cooperative Assessment Agreement: A Framework.....	243
15.2.2	Injury Determination and Restoration Planning.....	244

15.2.3	Resolution of Liability and Restoration Implementation	244
15.3	<i>Considerations and Issues in Cooperative Assessment</i>	245
15.3.1	Considerations	245
15.3.2	Risks Associated With Cooperative Assessments.....	250
15.3.3	Benefits of Cooperative Assessments.....	251
15.4	<i>Conclusion</i>	252

Appendices

1.	Table of State NRDA Authorities and Trustees.....	253
2.	Example Complaint Under CERCLA for Natural Resource Damages (United States v. BP, No. CV-04536 (D. La. Dec. 15, 2010)).....	263
3.	OSWER Directive No. 9295.0-02: MOU Between NOAA and U.S. EPA Concerning the Notification and Coordination of Activities Pursuant to CERCLA, U.S. EPA Office of Solid Waste and Emergency Response (Apr. 1992).....	293
4.	OSWER Directive No. 9200.4-22A: CERCLA Coordination With Natural Resource Trustees, U.S. EPA, Office of Solid Waste and Emergency Response (July 31, 1997).....	309
5.	Example Outline of a Damage Assessment and Restoration Plan and Environmental Assessment (Bermuda Islander Spill, Delaware Bay, Jan. 2013)	341
6.	Natural Resource Damage Claims Division, National Pollution Funds Center, U.S. Coast Guard, Natural Resource Damage Funding Guidelines (Mar. 2003)	379
7.	National Pollution Funds Center, U.S. Coast Guard, Claimant’s Information Guide (Nov. 2009).....	403
8.	Example Preassessment Screen (Sweet Water Mine, June 2008)	431
9.	Example MOA Between Trustees and Responsible Parties Governing Cooperative NRDA and Restoration Planning Activities (Bouchard Oil Spill, Oct. 2006)	445
10.	Example Invitation to Participate in a Natural Resource Damages Assessment.....	479
11.	Example Notice of Intent to Conduct Restoration Planning (BP Oil Spill, Sept. 27, 2010)	483
12.	Example Cooperative NRDA Assessment (MV Cape Flattery Oil Spill, 2005)	509
13.	Example Consent Decree Under CERCLA (United States v. Cosco Busan et al., No. C 07-60450-SC (N.D. Cal. 2008))	525

Online appendices referenced in this book can be found at www.eli.org/NRDA2d